



NATIONAL ASSEMBLY

FIRST SESSION

THIRTY-NINTH LEGISLATURE

Votes and Proceedings

of the Assembly

Wednesday, 21 April 2010 — No. 107

**President of the National Assembly:
Mr. Yvon Vallières**

QUÉBEC

The Assembly was called to order at 9.46 o'clock a.m.

ROUTINE PROCEEDINGS

Statements by Members

Mr. Morin (Montmagny-L'Islet) made a statement about the Grands Prix du tourisme.

Mrs. Léger (Pointe-aux-Trembles) made a statement about the 70th anniversary of women's right to vote.

Mr. Pigeon (Charlesbourg) made a statement about the work of the volunteers at the Centre d'hébergement de Charlesbourg.

Mrs. Poirier (Hochelaga-Maisonneuve) made a statement about the 70th anniversary of women's right to vote.

Mr. Grondin (Beauce-Nord) made a statement about the inn L'Auberge de Scott.

21 April 2010

Mr. Bernier (Montmorency) made a statement about the Fondation québécoise du cancer.

Mr. Khadir (Mercier) made a statement about Mr. Guy Paiement.

Mr. Dubourg (Viau) made a statement about the earthquake in China.

Mrs. Maltais (Taschereau) made a statement about the 70th anniversary of women's right to vote.

At 9.57 o'clock a.m. Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings for a few minutes.

The proceedings resumed at 10.10 o'clock a.m.

Moment of reflection

Presenting Papers

Mr. Hamad, Minister of Employment and Social Solidarity, tabled the following:

21 April 2010

The annual report from the Office de la sécurité du revenu des chasseurs et piégeurs cris for the fiscal year ended 30 June 2009.

(Sessional Paper No. 1216-20100421)

Mr. Dupuis, Government House Leader, tabled the following:

The reply from the Government to the petition tabled on 23 March 2010 by Mr. Villeneuve (Berthier) regarding the increase in the salary of the mayor of Saint-Barthélemy.

(Sessional Paper No. 1217-20100421)

Presenting Reports from Committees

Mr. Paquet (Laval-des-Rapides), committee chairman, tabled the following:

A report from the Committee on Public Finance, which met on 14, 15, and 20 April 2010 to continue the debate on the Budget Speech.

(Sessional Paper No. 1218-20100421)

Presenting Petitions

Mr. Ouimet (Marquette) tabled the following:

The abstract of a petition respecting taxes on the payrolls of small and medium-sized businesses, and signed by 64 members of the Canadian Federation of Independent Business.

(Sessional Paper No. 1219-20100421)

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 63, Mr. Diamond (Maskinongé) tabled the following:

21 April 2010

The abstract of a petition respecting taxes on the payrolls of small and medium-sized businesses, and signed by 63 members of the Canadian Federation of Independent Business.

(Sessional Paper No. 1220-20100421)

Oral Questions and Answers

The Assembly proceeded to Oral Question Period.

At the request of Mr. President, Mrs. Hivon (Joliette) withdrew certain words deemed unparliamentary on two occasions.

Motions Without Notice

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 185, Mrs. Marois, Leader of the Official Opposition, together with Mr. Charest, Premier, Mr. Deltell, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière), Mr. Caire (La Peltrie), and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved:

THAT the National Assembly note the 70th anniversary
of women's right to vote in Québec.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate concluded, the motion was carried.

Mr. Gautrin, Deputy Government House Leader, together with Mr. Bonnardel (Shefford), Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière), Mr. Caire (La Peltrie), and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved a motion respecting the payment of bonuses to senior managers in the public service and in other public bodies; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

21 April 2010

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Orders 84.1 and 185, Mrs. St-Pierre, Minister of Culture, Communications and the Status of Women, together with Mrs. Beaudoin (Rosemont), Mrs. Roy (Lotbinière), Mr. Picard (Chutes-de-la-Chaudière), Mr. Caire (La Peltrie), and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved:

THAT the National Assembly mark the 95th anniversary in commemoration of the Armenian genocide, which will be observed on April 24 next.

By leave of the Assembly, a debate arose thereon.

The debate concluded, the motion was carried.

At the invitation of Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, the Assembly observed a minute of silence.

Mrs. Beaudoin (Rosemont), together with Mr. Arcand, Minister of International Relations, Mrs. Roy (Lotbinière), and Mr. Khadir (Mercier), moved a motion concerning the acts of repression and intimidation committed against the members of the Rwandan opposition parties; this motion could not be debated for want of unanimous consent.

Notices of Proceedings in Committees

Mr. Gauthrin, Deputy Government House Leader, convened the following Committees:

- the Committee on Agriculture, Fisheries, Energy and Natural Resources, to begin clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 84, An Act to amend the Act respecting the Régie de l'énergie as regards the reliability of electric power transmission;
- the Committee on Institutions, to continue clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 83, An Act to provide a framework for mandatory state financing of certain legal services;

21 April 2010

- the Committee on Culture and Education, to continue clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 44, An Act to amend the General and Vocational Colleges Act with respect to governance;
- the Committee on Planning and the Public Domain, to continue clause-by-clause consideration of Bill 58, An Act to amend the Act respecting land use planning and development and other legislative provisions concerning metropolitan communities.

And, by leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 143:

- the Committee on Transportation and the Environment, to complete its public hearings within the framework of special consultations on Bill 90, An Act concerning Parc national du Mont-Orford.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Business Having Precedence

Debate on the Budget Speech

The Assembly resumed the debate, suspended at the sitting of 14 April 2010, on the motion by Mr. Bachand, Minister of Finance, —That this Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government, and on the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau), Mr. Khadir (Mercier), Mrs. Marois, Leader of the Official Opposition, Mr. Aussant (Nicolet-Yamaska), Mr. Drainville (Marie-Victorin), Mr. Bergeron (Verchères), Mr. Deltell, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Mr. Simard (Richelieu), Mr. Kotto (Bourget), and Mr. Curzi (Borduas), subject to the receivability of these motions.

21 April 2010

The debate being concluded, Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, ruled as follows on the receivability of the motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Aussant (Nicolet-Yamaska), Mr. Deltell, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Mr. Kotto (Bourget), and Mr. Curzi (Borduas):

RULING FROM THE CHAIR

The motions stating a grievance moved by Mr. Aussant (Nicolet-Yamaska), Mr. Deltell, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, Mr. Kotto (Bourget), and Mr. Curzi (Borduas) during the debate on the Budget Speech are unreceivable because they contain argumentation, contrary to the provisions of Standing Order 191.

On behalf of the Members concerned Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, asked leave of the Assembly to substitute for the aforementioned unreceivable motions the following new motions, which are in conformity with the Standing Orders:

A motion by Mr. Aussant (Nicolet-Yamaska) that would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Premier, the Minister of Finance, the Minister of Revenue, and the Chair of the Conseil du trésor for their refusal to discuss with Ottawa the introduction of a single tax return for Québec to lighten the tax burden on Québec taxpayers by \$500 million each year.

A motion by Mr. Deltell, Leader of the Second Opposition Group, that would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Liberal government for its 2010-2011 budget, which, in order to re-establish fiscal balance, further taxes the taxpayers of Québec without having undertaken a true exercise to cut expenditures.

A motion by Mr. Kotto (Bourget) that would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Premier, the Minister of Finance, and the Minister of Culture, Communications and the Status of Women, who, in their budget, demonstrate an inability to safeguard the cultural participation of the middle class within Québec.

21 April 2010

A motion by Mr. Curzi (Borduas) that would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Premier and the Minister of Education for having increased by only 2.2% the budget allocated to education, without taking into account the conspicuous needs, particularly with respect to those who drop out of school.

For want of unanimous consent the said new motions could not be substituted as proposed, and the question could therefore not be put on the motions stating a grievance moved by the Members concerned.

Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, then proceeded to put the question on the motions stating a grievance moved during the debate on the Budget Speech.

First, the question was put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Liberal government severely for its 2010-2011 budget, which considerably increases the tax burden on Quebeckers with no guarantee of better control over government expenditures.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **76** in Appendix)

Yeas: **51** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Khadir (Mercier). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly censure the Government severely for having presented a budget whose consequence will be to durably impoverish the great majority of the population of Québec and to outrageously favour the well-to-do minority and private interests, who exercise an antidemocratic influence on public decision-makers.

1210

21 April 2010

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **77** in Appendix)

Yeas: **51** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

The question was next put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Marois, Leader of the Official Opposition. This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly condemn the Liberal government for its 2010-2011 budget, which is not true to the Premier's electoral promises.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **78** in Appendix)

Yeas: **51** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Drainville (Marie-Victorin). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Premier and the Minister of Health and Social Services for imposing the \$200 Liberal tax on health as well as for imposing a tax on sickness in the form of a user fee.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negated on the following vote:

(Division No. **79** in Appendix)

Yeas: **51** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

21 April 2010

The question was thereafter put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bergeron (Verchères). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Premier and the Minister of Transport for their lack of rigour in letting the ministry's contracts.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **80** in Appendix)

Yeas: **51** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

The question was then put on the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Simard (Richelieu). This motion reads as follows:

THAT the National Assembly severely censure the Premier and the Chair of the Conseil du trésor for their inability to control the Government's expenditures.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was negatived on the following vote:

(Division No. **81** in Appendix)

Yeas: **51** Nays: **61** Abstentions: **0**

Finally, the question was put on the motion moved by Mr. Bachand, Minister of Finance, —That this Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government.

A recorded division was thereupon demanded. The motion was carried on the following vote:

21 April 2010

(Division No. **82** in Appendix)

Yeas: **61** Nays: **52** Abstentions: **0**

At 1.07 o'clock p.m., Mr. Gendron, Third Vice-President, suspended the proceedings until 3.00 o'clock p.m.

The proceedings resumed at 3.00 o'clock p.m.

Business Standing in the Name of Members in Opposition

Mr. Simard (Richelieu) moved:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec condemn the continuance of policies respecting the payment of bonuses to senior directors of government businesses and corporations and that it demand the prohibition of the payment of such bonuses or allowances as from 1 April 2009.

Mrs. Houda-Pepin, First Vice-President, informed the Assembly of the allocation of speaking time for the proceedings with respect to this motion: ten minutes shall be allotted to the mover of the motion for his reply; five minutes shall be allotted to the Member for Mercier; three minutes 15 seconds shall be allotted to the other two independent Members; seven minutes 45 seconds shall be allotted to the Second Opposition Group; and the rest of the time available shall be divided equally between the parliamentary group forming the Government and the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition. Within this framework any time not used by the independent Members or the Members from the Second Opposition Group shall be redistributed equally between the parliamentary group forming the Government and the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition; and any time not used by the parliamentary group forming the Government shall be attributed to the parliamentary group forming the Official Opposition, and vice versa. Lastly, individual addresses shall not be limited.

21 April 2010

A debate arose on the motion moved by Mr. Simard (Richelieu).

At the end of his address Mr. Gauthrin, Deputy Government House Leader, moved:

THAT the motion by the Member for Richelieu be amended as follows: by replacing, in the first line, the words "condemn the continuance of policies respecting" by the words "invite the Government to introduce an act that would suspend for two years"; by replacing, in the third line, the words "government businesses and" by the words "the public service, the health and education networks, the universities, public bodies, and government"; and by replacing, in the fourth and fifth lines, the words "it demand the prohibition of the payment of such bonuses or allowances as from 1 April 2009" by the words "the National Assembly solemnly ask the boards of directors of government corporations of a commercial or financial nature to adjust the policies for compensating their senior managers by making a comparable effort".

The motion, as amended, would read as follows:

THAT the National Assembly of Québec invite the Government to introduce an act that would suspend for two years the payment of bonuses to senior directors of the public service, the health and education networks, the universities, public bodies, and government corporations; and

THAT the National Assembly solemnly ask the boards of directors of government corporations of a commercial or financial nature to adjust the policies for compensating their senior managers by making a comparable effort.

This amendment could not be considered for want of consent by the mover of the main motion.

The debate continued on the motion moved by Mr. Simard (Richelieu).

21 April 2010

By leave of the Assembly to set aside Standing Order 53, Mr. Gignac, Minister of Economic Development, Innovation and Export Trade, tabled the following:

Copy of a letter, dated 31 March 2010, signed by Mr. Pierre Shedleur, Chief Executive Officer of the Société de financement du Québec and addressed to Mr. Jean Bazin, Chairman of the Board of Directors of the Société générale de financement du Québec, about the salary to which he is entitled.

(Sessional Paper No. 1221-20100421)

The debate continued on the motion moved by Mr. Simard (Richelieu).

The debate being concluded, the question was put on this motion; a recorded division was thereupon demanded.

At the request of Mr. Gautrin, Deputy Government House Leader, the division was deferred until Routine Proceedings on the next sitting day.

Government Bills

Passage in Principle

By leave of the Assembly, Mrs. Beauchamp, Minister of Sustainable Development, Environment and Parks, moved, —That Bill 90, An Act concerning Parc national du Mont-Orford, do now pass in principle.

A debate arose thereon.

21 April 2010

At 6.00 o'clock p.m. Mr. Chagnon, Second Vice-President, adjourned the Assembly until Thursday, 22 April 2010, at 9.45 o'clock a.m.

YVON VALLIÈRES

President

21 April 2010

APPENDIX

Recorded Divisions

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Marceau (Rousseau):

(Division No. 76)

YEAS - 51

Beaudoin <i>[Rosemont]</i>	Doyer	Lemay	Richard
Beaudoin <i>[Mirabel]</i>	Drainville	Malavoy	<i>[Duplessis]</i>
Bédard	Dufour	Maltais	Richard
Bergeron	Ferland	Marceau	<i>[Marguerite-D'Youville]</i>
Blanchet	Gaudreault	Marois	Robert
Bonnardel	<i>[Jonquière]</i>	McKay	Roy
Boucher	Gauvreau	Pagé	Simard
Bouillé	Girard	Pelletier	<i>[Richelieu]</i>
Caire	Grondin	<i>[Saint-Hyacinthe]</i>	St-Arnaud
Champagne	Hivon	Pelletier	Traversy
Charette	Khadir	<i>[Rimouski]</i>	Tremblay
Cloutier	Kotto	Pinard	Trottier
Deltell	Lapointe	Poirier	Turcotte
	Leclair	Rathé	Villeneuve
	Léger	Rebello	

NAYS - 61

Arcand	Charlebois	James	Pigeon
Auclair	Corbeil	Kelley	Reid
Bachand <i>[Arthabaska]</i>	Courchesne	L'Écuyer	Rotiroti
Bachand <i>[Outremont]</i>	D'Amour	Lehouillier	Simard
Beauchamp	Diamond	Lessard	<i>[Dubuc]</i>
Bergman	Drolet	MacMillan	Sklavounos
Bernard	Dubourg	Mamelonet	St-Amand
Bernier	Dupuis	Marcoux	St-Pierre
Billette	Dutil	Marsan	Thériault
Blais	Gagnon-Tremblay	Matte	Tomassi
Bolduc	Gaudreault	Ménard	Vallée
Boulet	<i>[Hull]</i>	Moreau	Vien
Carrière	Gautrin	Morin	Weil
Charbonneau	Gignac	Normandeau	Whissell
Charest	Gonthier	Ouellette	
	Hamad	Ouimet	
	Huot	Paquet	

21 April 2010

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Khadir (Mercier):

(Division No. 77)

(Identical to Division No. 76)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mrs. Marois, Leader of the Official Opposition:

(Division No. 78)

(Identical to Division No. 76)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Drainville (Marie-Victorin):

(Division No. 79)

(Identical to Division No. 76)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Bergeron (Verchères):

(Division No. 80)

(Identical to Division No. 76)

On the motion stating a grievance moved by Mr. Simard (Richelieu):

(Division No. 81)

(Identical to Division No. 76)

21 April 2010

On the motion by Mr. Bachand, Minister of Finance, –That this Assembly approves in general the budgetary policy of the Government:

(Division No. 82)

YEAS - 61

Arcand	Charlebois	James	Pigeon
Auclair	Corbeil	Kelley	Reid
Bachand	Courchesne	L'Écuyer	Rotiroti
<i>[Arthabaska]</i>	D'Amour	Lehouillier	Simard
Bachand	Diamond	Lessard	<i>[Dubuc]</i>
<i>[Outremont]</i>	Drolet	MacMillan	Sklavounos
Beauchamp	Dubourg	Mamelonet	St-Amand
Bergman	Dupuis	Marcoux	St-Pierre
Bernard	Dutil	Marsan	Thériault
Bernier	Gagnon-Tremblay	Matte	Tomassi
Billette	Gaudreault	Ménard	Vallée
Blais	<i>[Hull]</i>	Moreau	Vien
Bolduc	Gautrin	Morin	Weil
Boulet	Gignac	Normandeau	Whissell
Carrière	Gonthier	Ouellette	
Charbonneau	Hamad	Ouimet	
Charest	Huot	Paquet	

NAYS - 52

Aussant	Deltell	Léger	Rebello
Beaudoin	Doyer	Lemay	Richard
<i>[Rosemont]</i>	Drainville	Malavoy	<i>[Duplessis]</i>
Beaudoin	Dufour	Maltais	Richard
<i>[Mirabel]</i>	Ferland	Marceau	<i>[Marguerite-D'Youville]</i>
Bédard	Gaudreault	Marois	Robert
Bergeron	<i>[Jonquière]</i>	McKay	Roy
Blanchet	Gauvreau	Pagé	Simard
Bonnardel	Girard	Pelletier	<i>[Richelieu]</i>
Boucher	Grondin	<i>[Saint-Hyacinthe]</i>	St-Arnaud
Bouillé	Hivon	Pelletier	Traversy
Caire	Khadir	<i>[Rimouski]</i>	Tremblay
Champagne	Kotto	Pinard	Trottier
Charette	Lapointe	Poirier	Turcotte
Cloutier	Leclair	Ratthé	Villeneuve